
Seasonal agricultural workers and the habitus of mobile precarity

Samantha Jackson

McMaster University,
1280 Main St W, Hamilton, ON L8S 4L8, Canada
Email: sjackson@mcmaster.ca

Abstract: This article uses habitus as a tool to unpack the transnational experience of workers who move between Canada and home through the Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program (SAWP). Through disciplining regulations and annual forced exits, the SAWP engenders a particular form of transnationalism that is marked by precarity but also efforts to subversively carve out space at home and abroad. Habitus provides a unifying theory to understand workers' experiences while also locating the SAWP within broader systems of exclusion. This article moves in three parts: first, transnationalism and habitus are examined as tools to explore the experiences of SAWP workers. Then, the SAWP policy context is reviewed. It concludes with an analysis of migrant workers' renegotiations of the boundaries of habitus through subversive acts of citizenship.

Keywords: habitus; transnationalism; temporary worker; migration; border; seasonal agricultural worker; precarity; Canada.

Reference to this paper should be made as follows: Jackson, S. (2019) 'Seasonal agricultural workers and the habitus of mobile precarity', *Int. J. Migration and Border Studies*, Vol. 5, Nos. 1/2, pp.99–117.

Biographical notes: Samantha Jackson is a graduate of McMaster University's Comparative Public Policy PhD program. Her research analyses efforts to expand newcomers' access to rights and services.

This paper is a revised and expanded version of a paper entitled 'Employer-as-gatekeeper: Mobile precarity, temporary labourers, and the reproduction of structural inequality' presented at *Dis/placing the Borders of North America*, McMaster University, 14 October 2016.

1 Introduction

Through programs managed by governments and by private actors, temporary workers play a central role in labour markets around the world. Insufficient oversight and/or a lack of political will to enforce legal protections often results in dangerous working conditions and violations of workers' rights. In Qatar, 'foreign workers' preparing the nation for the 2022 FIFA World Cup are subject to movement restrictions, stolen wages

and inhumane treatment from employers (Amnesty International, 2016). 'Guest workers' in the United States on H-2 visas regularly work hours beyond their contracts and live in sub-standard conditions (Giammarinaro, 2016). In Canada, temporary foreign workers (TFW) work across provinces and industries in programs that require employees to work long hours without overtime, to contribute to but not benefit from government programs, and whose return to Canada is at the discretion of the employer. TFW programs only recently drew widespread public ire when workers in desirable positions entered the public eye (Black, 2014; Robertson and Curry, 2017). However, 'low-skilled' TFW workers, including agricultural workers in Canada under the Seasonal Agricultural Workers Program (SAWP), remain largely out of sight.

The SAWP's relative detachment and potential for exploitability is troubling; federal and provincial policy regimes have devolved substantial power to private interests, such that employers are now migration gatekeepers. Workers' labour is devalued along sociodemographic lines and through exclusionary policies that exclude workers from the 'rules of the game' of the greater Canadian labour market (e.g., Bauder, 2008). Agricultural workers most often live on the premises of their employer, who decides which workers receive work permissions, who is invited to rejoin the workforce the following year, and who must exit the country permanently. Seasonal work schedules and favourable employer reviews often return workers to Canada for decades, but on contracts that require annual departures and offer no path to permanency. Seasonal workers enter into permanently temporary contracts, and transform economies at home and abroad through their work on the transnational 'survival circuit' (Sassen, 2002). (Sassen, 2002). Yet as a standalone paradigm, transnationalism is not able to fully address the daily lives and personal experiences of temporary workers. The SAWP's policy and institutional features place particular constraints on workers that circumscribe their daily activities at home and abroad; still, workers are agentic and engage in subversive acts of resistance. *Habitus* (Bourdieu, 1977, 1985) provides a lens to reconcile these tensions and enrich a transnational analysis of migrant workers. *Habitus* as a framework calls attention to the disciplining effects of SAWP regulations and socialisations but also the greater systems of racial and gender inequalities in which they exist. Identifying how these factors are embodied to form the perennial circular workers' *habitus* highlights the impact of field (Bourdieu, 1985) as circular migrants travel between home and abroad.

To this end, the transnational experiences of migrant farm workers are underexplored; so too are transnationalism's limitations as a tool to understand migrant workers' experiences. *Habitus* provides a useful entry point to organise existing research, and a theoretical framework through which to understand their transnational experiences. The goal of this article is to extend the concept of transnationalism to circular migrants by centering on their agency, as enacted through acts of citizenship (Isin, 2002) and by inserting themselves into local social fabrics as a form of resistance (e.g., Preibisch and Grez, 2013; J4MW, 2018). This article moves in three parts. First, transnationalism and *habitus* are examined as tools to explore the experiences of SAWP workers. Then, the SAWP policy context is reviewed. It concludes with an analysis of migrant workers' subversive acts of citizenship that renegotiate the boundaries of their *habitus*.

2 Conceptual framework

2.1 Transnationalism

Transnationalism examines the processes and impacts of activities that simultaneously connect a person to their countries of origin and settlement. Transnationalism studies originated to re-centre analyses on immigrants as having agency, choice, and impact through cross-border activities, a shift in contrast to the largely structural approaches that viewed migration as the result of push and pull factors (e.g., Smith and Guarnizo, 1998). It also represented a departure from zero-sum identity perspectives that assumed identity, loyalty, and connections can be made only to one country (Glick Schiller et al., 1995). For example, Basch et al. (1994) frame transnationalism as disrupting the permanent/temporary binary by permitting people to inhabit multiple places at once. In existing meaningfully in multiple places, migrant workers provide material, social, political and economic benefit to their country of origin and immigration (Iskander, 2010). Not unlike habitus and field, transnationalism can manifest as differences in behaviour across localities (Ley, 2004 in Erdal and Oeppen, 2013). Roberts et al. (1999) find that at minimum, transnational experiences “provide[] immigrants with opportunities and perspectives that are alternatives to committing themselves exclusively either to the new society or the old” (p.242). However, the ability to absorb alternative ways of knowing is a product of institutional context, whereby policy but also race, gender, and citizenship will border a person’s access to new places (e.g., Goldring and Landolt, 2013). Transnationalism’s focus on the ‘in-betweenness’ of identities does not sufficiently capture the daily experiences of migrant workers, whose ability to engage fully either at home or abroad is circumscribed.

Literature that operationalises the transnationality frame vis-à-vis temporary workers is limited but includes analyses of its gendered and familial effects (Hennebry, 2014; Preibisch and Grez, 2013), with respect to remittances and communications (Hennebry, 2008) and the impact of isolation (Kearney, 1995). Still, the bulk of transnationalism research speaks more strongly to long-term migrants instead of circular migrants (Parreñas, 2010), or more broadly, to the experiences of migrants with relative ability to forge selective and voluntary attachments to new and old spaces, and the freedom recreate experiences in places of long-term (re)settlement (e.g., Bauböck, 2003; Beaverstock, 2005; Morawska, 2014; Tollefsen and Lindgren, 2006; Vertovec, 2001; Scott, 2006). Existing transnational theorising does not capture the experiences of seasonal migrants (Hennebry, 2014), whose ability to forge voluntary attachments is made difficult by precarious labour market policy and employer surveillance.

While transnational pursuits are often understood as disruptive, subversive efforts to reclaim immigrant space and identity ‘from below’ [Smith and Guarnizo, (1998), p.5], transnational acts are in part functions of a person’s freedom of expression and mobility. Still, SAWP workers may choose to engage in transnational acts, just as persons across all streams may choose to ‘do’ or not ‘do’ transnationalism (Portes et al., 2017). Parreñas (2010) asserts that circular migrants are not transnational because of the ‘lopsided affinity’ they feel for their hometowns. In her analysis of Philippian hostesses in Japan, the author finds that the homeward orientation of circular workers reflects, and is

reflected in workers' segregation. In this reading, workers are existing in two physical locations but remain singularly committed to one and therefore, are not transnational. This perspective does justice to the disciplining effects of segregation, but it does not account for migrants' efforts to exist politically, socially, and culturally across localities. While a disposition towards home is common, workers still forge new ties in their place of work, share components of their culture, adapt behaviour to new social institutions, and practice new languages to succeed in their new location. Moreover, workers' efforts to carve out seen (e.g., engaging with Canadian rights groups) and unseen (e.g., personal relationships with other workers) spaces of resistance are declarations of presence. In these ways transnationality is not synonymous with equal affinity to two or more places, but with asserting presence through continuing old traditions and forging new ways of being.

Indicators of transnationalism can be easily identifiable, such as sending financial remittances (Miyares et al., 2003). It can also be murkier, understood as an expression of continued, durable connections to entities, or, the creation of new ties to people and places in multiple locations at once (Ley, 2004 in Erdal and Oeppen, 2013). Migrant workers maintain continued connections to home and family once abroad, while work exerts ongoing influence once at home. Workers create new ties to people and places once abroad through subtle and shifting acts of resistance. This transnationality at the margins signals a claiming of space and presence across two geographies, often over the course of a lifetime.

Understanding workers' lived experiences through the lens of habitus enriches the literature on transnationalism by focusing on agency, but an agency that is institutionally precarious¹. This article is therefore interested in the transnational experiences of SAWP participants, which, for the program's emphasis on experiences divided between home and abroad, can be understood as a particular habitus of the temporary worker. It argues that the SAWP's employer-driven immigration scheme constructs a specific form of precarity that intends to preclude workers from forming a habitus of Canada, and instead, to form a habitus of enclaved mobile precarity.

2.2 *Habitus*

As an approach, habitus incorporates migrant agency, which in turn highlights workers' transnationality. It also supports an exploration of the nature and meaning of workers' actions and how these relate to workers' agency. Habitus is two pronged: first, it concerns the embodiment of a social context's expectations for behaviour and values; second, it concerns the involuntary, unconscious ways in which unspoken rules determine what is valued in society, as measured through various forms of capital (Kelly and Lusi, 2006). Habitus denotes the system of norms, practices, and behaviours of social groups operating within and reinforcing a constructed social context, or field, that is in turn embedded in everyday practices (Bourdieu, 1977). In this way, habitus is reflexive and dynamic, reflecting previous and evolving cultural practices and linking people to particular social locations (Ibrahim, 2016). The effect of the habitus, explained Bourdieu [1990b, p.77 in Reay, (2004), p.433], "is that agents who are equipped with it will behave in a certain way in certain circumstances" (p.77). As an organising mechanism, habitus "structures and formats tastes, preferences, and ultimately action", though it is not static and will include variations depending identities that structure how one interacts with the world, such as race or gender (Ibrahim, 2016).

Arising at the interplay agency and structure, habitus is an embodiment of a social context's conscious and unconscious expectations for behaviour and values (Kelly and Lusi, 2006). Habitus is expressed not just as a lens or worldview, but physical manifestations "of standing, speaking, walking and thereby of feeling and thinking" [Bourdieu, (1990a, p.70)]. The factors that shape one's location in the world shape one's habitus, meaning that it extends beyond policy frames to include macro-level norms and micro-level expressions. Thus, workers' habitus is not simply a reflection of SAWP policy, but the greater systems of racism, classism, and gendering in which SAWP workers are situated, through which workers' bodies, skills, and labour are devalued. The practices through which worker "subjectivities are constructed, subjugated, and contested" are located within broader neoliberal systems that produce diasporic populations for the benefit of labour-importing states [Smith, (2015), p.280; Trotz and Mullings, 2013]. Both Smith (2015) and Rotz (2017) situate the SAWP within Canada's broader colonial projects, including the 'othering' and racial ordering of Indigenous peoples. Smith (2015) identifies racialisation as a key explanatory variable in understanding migrant workers' formalised exclusion from rights, resources, and power.

Among other examples, circular workers' devaluation is expressed through precarious citizenship and work statuses. Precarity is enacted through processes and policies that deliberately limit, constrain, and shape the nature of SAWP workers' experiences and access to resources in order to maintain larger systems of power and inequity. This is manifested in commonly embodied experiences amongst workers, such as continuing to work in the face of exploitation. Goldring et al. (2009) find that a status is precarious if it lacks one or more of five characteristics associated with permanency: work authorisation, the ability to remain permanently, the ability to remain on one's own volition, access to social services and access to family reunification. Accordingly, with all characteristics lacking save for the legal authority to work, precarity is a characteristic of SAWP habitus.

Importantly, in migration, permanence is not synonymous with 'the ideal', just as temporariness is not "coterminous with vulnerability" [Raghuram, (2014), p.181]. Still, temporariness is often accompanied by disparate ability to enter, remain, travel or work freely, making it a defining, often legislated factor in the institutionalisation of precarity (Rajkumar et al., 2012). SAWP policies enforce permanently temporary, circular precarity as a means of precluding workers' access to time-based rights afforded to other temporary workers, such as unemployment benefits or the ability to mobilise coalitions to challenge poor working conditions. But as parallel Canadian migration streams demonstrate, neither precariousness or temporariness is inherent to temporary work (Rajkumar et al., 2012; Raghuram, 2014). Moreover, precariousness is neither static nor inherent; interacting with different social contexts, or what Bourdieu (1985) calls 'fields' will augment a habitus, such that workers will experience and embody their world differently whether they are at home or abroad (Ibrahim, 2016).

Indeed, while dispositions that constitute habitus are "inculcated by the possibilities and impossibilities, freedoms and necessities, opportunities and prohibitions inscribed in the objective conditions" [Bourdieu, (1990a), p.54], structures are not deterministic. Habitus is a "generative rather than determining structure", and thus can vary between and within fields, especially over time [Hilsdon, (2007), p.174]. While much is written around its seemingly decisive implications (e.g., Lamont, 1992; Widick, 2003), in later texts Bourdieu (e.g., 1999) challenges readings of habitus that suggest socialisation is absolute by highlighting the experiences of persons who carve out space for resistance. Citing Bourdieu (1999, p.55), Reay (2004) finds that 'choice is at the heart of habitus',

though still, “the choices inscribed in the habitus are limited” (p.435) and even forms of resistance are reflective of social context. Challenging the 'embodied everyday' creates tensions between a person's habitus and field, and can bring what are typically unconscious behaviours into sharp focus, which in turn creates opportunity for persons to intervene in their duplication (McNay in Reay, 2004).

Field and habitus also reflexively structure a worker's power, understood as capital. Bourdieu (1985) perceived capital as existing in multiple forms, including social, economic, cultural and symbolic capital. It is fungible; forms of capital can be converted to new types of capital and are often interlinked and overlapping to create social order and processes. Capital is relational and has value vis-à-vis a given field. Specific types of capital are often devalued in particular fields (e.g., workplaces) on the basis of sociodemographic characteristics like race. Both permanent and temporary migrants will bring cultural capital to a new place and begin negotiating its value with institutions and their gatekeepers (Erel, 2010). Negotiations produce asymmetrical results for migrants, who are often denied capital transformation or accumulation through explicit and routinised forms of exclusion, such as requiring local experience for employment or devaluing specific accents (Riaño and Baghdadi, 2007). While Bauder (2006) contends that “the longer immigrants remain in a country, the more they may adopt work attitudes that reflect the habitus of the non-migrant population” (p.712), SAWP members may return to the same Canadian work sites for decades and develop a particular SAWP habitus, but by design, will not accumulate the capital or embody the habitus of everyday Canadians (e.g., Kelly and Lusic, 2006).

Understanding SAWP workers' experiences as relating to a particular habitus places them in conversation with research that applies a Bourdieusian lens to understand the experiences of immigrants and refugees (e.g., Bauder, 2005; Cui, 2015; Inghilleri, 2005; Ryan et al., 2009), as well as that examining habitus and transnationality (e.g., Darwin and Norton, 2012; Kelly and Lusic, 2006; Nedelcu, 2012; Waters, 2007). While routinised life of workers has been theorised as a 'social quarantining' [Horgan and Liinamaa, (2016), p.10] and 'interior conditioning' (Binford, 2009), a Bourdieusian approach offer a unifying theory that tends to the socialising effects of class(ism), race(ism) and gender(ing), while also acknowledging the potential for workers to engage in actions that, subtly and viscerally, make manifest their unique transnationality.

3 Methodology and context

Multiple countries drive circular temporary migration and could be fitting analytical cases, especially as there is a dearth of research on circular migrants' settlement practices (Parreñas, 2010). The Canadian SAWP experience is particularly suited given its long history and prescriptive policies that seek to exclude workers from everyday Canadian life. Moreover, outside of the SAWP Canada has temporary migration streams that do offer a pathway to permanency. High-skilled streams, including those under the International Mobility Program as well as low-skilled streams including the Caring for Children/People with High Medical Needs Programs (formerly the Live-in Caregiver Program) and the Low-Skilled Pilot Program, have access to permanent residency². This is in stark contrast to the SAWP's contract-based employment scheme and its precipitating effects on workers' transnational experiences, making Canada an empirically and theoretically appropriate case for this analysis.

This article analyses existing research focusing on the SAWP, including that which focuses on the link between policy and workers' practices, behaviours and ways of experiencing context. Thus, the empirical contribution of the article does not rest on the presentation of new data, but on constructing migrants' transnational subjectivities through the study of their daily practices, and their acceptance, resilience and resistance to institutional and policy frameworks³.

While policy is but one factor in shaping habitus, the intentionality behind the SAWP's design creates a particular social world by attempting to forge patterns of behaviour in workers' daily lives. Thus, Canada's institutional and policy frameworks require unpacking in order to fully contextualise workers' habitus. Temporary foreign worker programs have existed in Canada since 1966 but were not formally legislated until 1973 (Lenard and Straehle, 2012). Multiple migration streams are included under the TFW banner and are crudely divided between high and low-skilled requirements workers. Notions of 'skill' are political, with migration regimes, political interests and regulatory bodies playing important roles constructing what it means to be *skilled* in a given context (Erel, 2010). The SAWP is a popular 'low-skill' agricultural stream that offers no direct pathway to permanent residency and requires visa holders to exit Canada within a given timeframe, or sooner at the discretion of their employer. Sending Caribbean states and Mexico hold bilateral SAWP agreements with Canada and are responsible for selecting the initial pool of qualified adult farm workers.

To hire a worker from these pools, Canadian employers apply for a Labour Market Impact Assessment (LMIA) to determine if they meet current labour shortage requirements. SAWP contracts cannot extend past eight months, and all workers must leave Canada at their contract's end. However, workers can return in perpetuity, and there are documented cases of persons returning to Canada each year for nearly four decades (Keung, 2017). Transferring employers is difficult; it requires knowledge of an employer with a valid LMIA and employment needs. Employers recover lodging costs from workers' wages, alongside utility costs and meals. Workers are to be paid the prevailing wage, though employers have been found to over-recoup costs and underpay workers (Faraday, 2014).

In 2004, nearly 20,000 persons from Mexico and the Caribbean came under the SAWP banner; this more than doubled to 41,702 in 2015 (Government of Canada, 2016). Canadian demand for temporary workers outside of the SAWP increased dramatically in the early 2000s in sectors including agriculture, construction, and food services. The rise came with little public debate, partly in response to genuine labour shortages but also to employers' preference for flexible, inexpensive migrant labour (Valiani, 2013). Employers' addiction to temporary work [Hildebrandt, (2004), n.p.] and demands to match work permits to seasonal labour cycles feeds the construction of low-skilled labour shortages as permanently temporary (Faraday, 2012).

4 SAWP workers and the habitus of mobile precarity

SAWP participants transcend national boundaries (Basch et al., 1994; Bailey, 2001) but by design, face barriers to social participation. If ports of entry are "seemingly static and yet increasingly mobile expression of state infrastructure and power" [Mountz, (2011), p.317], temporary workers experience mobile borders around their social and physical presence. Borders for TFWs are characterised by the fluidity of their size and shape –

relatively large at the point of entry, while narrowing entirely to inhibit full access to and presence in Canada⁴. Workers' contractual obligations and highly restricted mobility rights restrict their access to the opportunities and resources necessary to embed oneself in the broader socio-cultural habitus of migrants within Canada, amongst other potential social groups; instead, a habitus of mobile, transnational precarity shapes their perceptions and embodiments.

To begin, recruitment policy is designed to attract workers who will never fully commit to Canada. Familial obligations are valued as anchors to the country of origin. The 'ideal type' circular migrant embodies specific qualities and behaviours – he is male, comes from a rural background, attained the equivalent of a Canadian grade three education, and is married with children (Lenard and Strachle, 2012). The ideal 'traditional breadwinner in economic need' is likely to work hard to provide for those at home and to protest less against harsh working conditions to ensure they are invited to return (Smith, 2005). These workers are also less likely to develop sexual relationships with others, seek permanency via marriage or to try to remain in Canada (Preibisch and Santamaria, 2006). Employers can also select workers according to nationality, as particular workers are racialised as being "biologically suited for the travails of agricultural labour production" [Smith, (2015), p.280].

For SAWP workers, the workplace is designed to be the central point of reference in Canada. Most live and work on their employers' farms in rural Ontario, where they are often subject to 'farm rules' including curfews, limitations on social visitors and the policing of romantic relationships (Preibisch and Grez, 2010; Horgan and Liinamaa, 2016). These bordering practices limit engagement with the Canadian social context and actively circumscribe Canadian social or cultural capital accumulation. Embeddedness and exposure is exclusively to one's workplace during work and most social hours as workers face barriers to transportation and the cultural capital to access activities outside the farm, facilitating an understanding of Canadian society vis-à-vis the TFW program.

Social and physical seclusion erect practical barriers on transnational activities. Workers perform transnationality by sending vast cash flows in the form of remittances, but oft face challenges because of their geographical segregation (Hennebry, 2006; 2008). Communication with home also create transnational spaces within which temporary workers maintain ties but living without personal space and long work hours impact workers' ability to connect with family at home [e.g., Hennebry, (2008), p.353]. Long hours and working/living in a single locale also limits social relations with local people and institutions. Workers are excluded from settlement services that are available to most other immigrants, including language assistance, skills upgrading and access to legal and employment assistance. This renders people further ineligible for the types of higher-skilled work that offers pathways to permanency (e.g., Rajkumar et al., 2012). Moreover, workers' forced departure limits capital growth more broadly; Smith (2005) found SAWP workers' understanding of law truncated after experiencing home in "limited and discontinuous forms" (p.112; see also Gabriel and MacDonald, 2014). Indeed, it is not clear if temporary work streams provide any measurable growth in workers' skillset (Binford, 2003), an important marker of capital acquisition and habitus growth. Farms' predilection for hiring workers that share nationalities and sociodemographic backgrounds may offer familiarity and the potential for shared support systems amongst workers but limits the social capital exchanges typically associated with transnational movement. Expressions of the country of origin – be it food, language, discussion of politics – are designed to be restrained largely to the workplace. Such

social-spatial isolation amongst migrant workers can create new forms of transnational community that “tends to breed a vicious cycle of marginality” [Kearney, (1995), p.236].

Employers’ ability to fire and deport workers without justification or recourse can also have long-term impacts, as poor employer evaluations can result in a one- or two-year suspension or permanent removal from the program (Stasiulis, 2008). The long reach of employers’ power, which extends temporally across workplaces and borders, heightens workers’ exploitability. Indeed, if habitus is premised on the notion that “individuals act in the context of structured framework of evaluations and expectations” that feed an embodied understanding of which practices to prioritise, the constant literal, explicit evaluations and embodied surveillance hardens a particular disposition tied to their social-spatial location [Kelly and Lusic, (2006), p.833].

Like any habitus, the ability to follow the ‘rules of the game’ determines a worker’s membership to the group of perceived *good* workers, which has a disciplining effect on their behaviour (Bourdieu, 1990b). This context consciously and unconsciously shapes the behaviours and disposition of workers, who embody precarity in an effort to be ‘named’ (specifically requested) by employers in order to return as an employee the following season. Workers’ ‘institutionalised deportability’ [Vosko, (2018), p.1] increases pressure to accept employer demands and challenging work conditions (Preibisch and Grez, 2010; McLaughlin and Hennebry, 2013), leading workers to accept longer hours, harsher working conditions, and sacrifice social interactions (Valiani, 2013; Preibisch and Grez, 2010). Evidence of employees forgoing medical attention in order to avoid halting work and leaving the workplace also abounds. Workers are insured but still face physical and social face barriers to accessing care, with reports of workers leaving at the end of their contract without an exit health screening, posing potential risks to themselves and their communities (Preibisch and Hennebry, 2011). Workers are also encouraged to report ‘bad’ behaviour amongst their colleagues (Preibisch and Grez, 2010), a mechanism to remove underperformers and foster competition between workers (Smith, 2015).

SAWP experiences are also highly gendered. Preibisch and Grez (2010, 2013) find employers and their delegates exercise control over women’s physical and sexual movements through policies restricting female SAWP workers to the farm property, limiting contact with workers of the opposite sex, and implementing curfews (see also Becerril, 2007). Women workers are found to live in crowded housing that may exacerbate tensions and limit social ties, fostering environments of distrust in enclaved areas, isolated from the greater community and highly conducive to monotonous, routinised lives (Preibisch and Grez, 2010). Preibisch (2005) also found that SAWP prohibitions and practical limitations on bringing children prompts mothers to leave children with relatives or neighbours, eliciting a feeling of failure amongst women who perceived their gender-based roles as unfulfilled while abroad.

The act of permanently migrating is also itself a health risk for workers, where social exclusion alongside harsh living conditions pose increased risk to workers’ health (Edmunds et al., 2011). Home-based and migrant community members are found to ostracise female temporary workers, stigmatising them simultaneously as poor mothers for choosing to leave and as sexually promiscuous, available women for working in a male-dominated environment (Preibisch, 2005; Preibisch and Santamaria 2006), which further marginalises their social embeddedness on the farm and at home. Now in its fourth decade with many lifelong migrant members, the largely unchanged SAWP has imbued a certain social order within workers’ literal and theoretical field, and has

normalised experiences of social difference, hierarchy and ‘a sense of one’s place’ over time [Bourdieu, (1990b), p.131].

As a different field (i.e., set of relationships, networks within which identity and power are renegotiated), workers’ habitus at home will differ from that experienced abroad. Power, position and capital are highly contextual, and will be experienced differently across fields (e.g., Moncrieffe, 2006). Persons whose capital is made limited abroad may still return home with social and cultural capital gained, albeit versions heavily prescribed by policy. The repetitious, cyclical nature of workers’ enclavement can also generate forms of exclusion or ‘otherness’ in workers’ country of origin and returning to a community of origin is rarely a seamless re-integration (Binford, 2009). However, our understanding of life ‘at home’ for SAWP workers is scarce, but insights gleaned from research on the Mexico-United States labour circuit suggests returning workers may benefit from new cultural capital but may also experience social discomfort from long periods abroad (Pérez-Armendáriz, 2014). Workers’ are often presumed to suffer ‘humiliations, privations, and discrimination’ while abroad, which informs community members’ lens of returning workers as ‘disorderly’ [Fitzgerald, (2013), p.124]. Examining the SAWP, Binford (2009) describes workers’ partial straddling of two worlds as creating a ‘dual frame of reference’, where experience in other labour markets and across other geographies may inform assessments of home labour markets and limit one’s ability to re-acclurate and adjust their personal expectations.

At home, the TFW system also affects specific, gendered transnational experiences. Hennebry (2014) finds that guest workers’ families are central to circular migration’s transnational exchanges. Contrary to previous transnationalism literature’s findings, transnationalism further denigrates workers “into a racialized and gendered system that may extend their precarity among families, across borders” (p.56). Workers are pulled into a transnational existence but denied control over migration schedules, contracts, working conditions, and the ability to embed their families into their transnational lives. Yet still, families are impacted by workers’ transnationality and are shaped by cross-border practices. Women in particular support transnational connections while at home by supporting workers’ pre-migration requirements, managing remittances, and taking on the agricultural workload and familial roles of the migrant spouse, in addition to other household labour, managing remittances (Binford, 2003; Hennebry, 2014).

Workers’ health-related behaviour also reflects their mobile precarity, even when at home. Prior to departing, health and fitness is tested as a requirement of the SAWP program, including medical testing and ‘sorting’ to determine who is healthy according to Canadian guidelines (Smith, 2015). Women’s health is of particular focus, where decisions are made in light of their return to Canada. Reproduction is subtly and explicitly discouraged, as childbirth and pregnancy are perceived as a ‘major inconvenience’ for employers and is treated as an unofficial ground for repatriation (Preibisch and Grez, 2010). Women may limit their number of children while at home in order to not miss a season and falling out of favour with employers, and pre-departure orientations led by the Mexican government formerly included waivers pledging to avoid pregnancy. Workers’ habitus and the greater systems of inequality in which they are located are particularly evident in workers’ inability to draw employment insurance or from the Canadian Pension Plan despite contributing to such programs with each paycheque. This may extend their working years well beyond the typical Canadian age of retirement, a transnational exclusion that is particularly emblematic of workers’ precarity.

Life in the sending community may change fundamentally for temporary workers who enter and exit in a contracted rhythm and for those who return home permanently from circular migration. Similarly, life in the host community is partitioned, creating a highly localised international experience. Collectively, these experiences of dislocation that are driven by policies that place workers at the behest of employers while short-term, cyclical contracts create a distinct form of enclaved transnationalism. This mobile precarity habitus is constantly reconstructed by the ongoing relationship of control between employer and employee, a proximity that regulates (dis)empowerment and place in a manner unlike other temporary or permanent migration streams.

More research into the lives of workers traversing the SAWP circuit is needed to understand workers' experiences at home as they await return to their Canadian workplaces.

5 Labour (im)mobility and resistance

While profound in its effects, workers' circular mobility and habitus of precarity cannot be conflated with an inevitable fate towards disempowerment or an inability to assert agency. To the contrary, resistance among temporary workers in Canada (e.g., Gleeson, 2009; J4MW, 2018; McLaughlin, 2009, Migrant Workers Alliance for Change, 2018; Preibisch, 2004; Smith, 2005) and internationally (Muniandy and Bonatti, 2014; Portes and Fernández-Kelly, 2015) is palpable. It is this assertion of presence and enactment of transnationality, however circumscribed by habitus and SAWP policy, that places circular migrants within the transnational conversation (e.g., Parreñas, 2010). As noted by Henneby (2008), political action and resistance takes many forms, from participating in research to contributing to documentaries such as *El Contrato* (2003) and *Migrant Dreams* (2016). Foregrounding workers' agency reflects actions recorded in SAWP workers' literal and theoretical fields while also responding to the fallacy of permitting the 'rules of the game' to be overly determinative in habitus formation (Bourdieu, 1977, 1990b).

Transnationalism's emphasis on agency does not preclude its application to SAWP and similar programs' participants, but rather, provides tools to understand how migrants combat exclusion from dominant structures and validates temporary workers' alternative strategies to insert oneself into these institutions (e.g., Raghuram, 2008). Indeed, transnationality can be conceived as an act of resistance to capitalist structures and global inequities, especially those which push people to become migrant workers (Karim, 1998; Vetovec, 2001). Rights movements of irregular residents manifest in various campaigns to increase persons' visibility as they seek to regularise and humanise their status (Nyers, 2010).

Acts of citizenship are "those moments when, regardless of status and substance, subjects constitute themselves as citizens – or, better still, as those to whom the right to have rights is due" (p.18). Migrant workers' acts of citizenship include acting outside of the prescribed everyday routine of the SAWP. By creating meaningful connections and asserting their presence on the farms and in the communities where they live, migrant workers push the boundaries of their habitus. Workers also validate new cultural capital through institutions of greater Canadian society, such as by declaring their cultural identity valuable to discourses around the Canadian cultural mosaic (Gabriel and McDonald, 2011). Similarly, on the individual level, workers will engage in acts that

complicate their segregation by forming social and economic ties, including by learning English and participating in recreational activities (Dance, 2014; Municipality of Leamington, 2017; Mojtehdzadeh et al., 2017), learning of and asserting one's labour rights (Smith, 2005), forming meaningful relationships with persons inside and outside their workplace (Enlace Canada, 2012; UFCW, 2018; Preibisch and Grez, 2013), as well as speaking to the media (Rankin, 2017) and participating in research activities. Preibisch and Grez (2013) found women working in temporary migrant programs 'expand their citizenship' by renegotiating their gender and economic roles at home and abroad, and by engaging in romantic or sexual relationships only available to them in transnational spaces (p.789). Subversive acts to claim and expand transnational space are ways to enact citizenship across dimensions, a political act to overcome exclusion created by the legal frameworks that deny workers' access to traditional legal citizenship.

Such assertions for the right to have rights can also quite tangible. For example, workers, especially those who have returned to Canada for many years, may begin to form in-Canada social networks and alliances with one another and with migrant rights groups. Through this grassroots consolidation, workers engage in acts such as organising to claim their contributory benefits (Migrant Workers Alliance for Change, 2018), improving quality and access to consular services in Canada (Migrante Canada, 2018) and pushed for the right to unionise. By shedding light on the existence of TFWs in Canada and the conditions they experience, worker-led activist groups push for changes at the policy and individual employer level. Alliances such the West Coast Domestic Workers Association, Justicia for Migrant Workers (J4MW), and KAIROS represent but a few of the worker-led anti-exploitation organisations seeking to redress workers' exploitation and lobby for policy change such as access to permanency and family reunification. Organisations also provide support for workers where labourers live, such as the United Agriculture Workers Alliance for Change Support Centre in Leamington, Ontario, a town dependent on SAWPs for annual agricultural work.

These everyday acts of transnationalism resist the SAWP's social disciplining effects as workers assert the right to have rights, and the right to exist fully outside of the social, workplace and legal restrictions of the SAWP. Politicised TFWs can disrupt the mechanisms of mobile precarity such as seclusion and invisibility in order to claim rights and assert presence within their host country communities. While efforts to dismantle the habitus of mobile precarity are frequently curtailed through the SAWP's ability to 'divide and conquer' workers (such as by redistributing politically active workers to new workspaces with new colleagues, or by blacklisting persons to prevent their return (UFCW, 2012), acts of permanence and citizenship do occur and visibility is sought by Canada's migrant workers, fueling broader worker movements that advocate for change at the policy level.

Located between free and unfree labour, seasonal workers' "agency is exercised in context, and contexts are always more or less constrained by material and other factors" [Kelly, 2003 in Silverman and Hari, (2016), p.96]. While grassroots organising and worker-resident alliances are able to demand space and recognition, notably absent is workers' ability to effect wide-scale change through unionising. Workers' legal ability to join existing unions or create their own varies across provinces. Canada's highest court, the Supreme Court of Canada upheld Ontario provincial legislation prohibiting workers from unionising in 2011, a decision that stands to affect labour organising in all provinces. Indeed, in an act of unmaking citizenship, employers have been accused of hiring TFWs as a means of weakening union presence and impact where TFWs fall

outside of their regular purview (UFCW, 2014). Still, in a meatpacking plant in northern Alberta, temporary labourers are under the purview of United Food and Commercial Workers (UFCW) Local 1118. Remarkably, the Local's collective agreement instructs that employers must help their TFWs apply for permanent residency, if desired by the worker [Hildebrant, (2014), n.p.]. However, the UFCW Local 1118 notes that other locals face difficulties in replicating their program, noting that employers are "reluctant to let go of the 'ultimate hammer' held over TFW – the threat of sending them home" [Hildebrant, (2014), n.p.; see also J4MW, 2017]. Conditions must be right to unionise; when workers attempt to organise, the sending country may respond to please the Canadian government by either blacklisting the workers or allowing them to return, but to different locations under different employers (UFCW, 2012).

6 Conclusions

Through an analysis of the impacts of circular, enclaved migration, this article has examined the everyday precarity experienced by seasonal agricultural workers in Canada through the lens of habitus. Habitus, as the interplay between structure and agency (e.g., Reay, 2004), provides a unifying theory through which to understand the particular transnational experiences of circular workers by locating workers' experiences within policy and normative systems, while also allowing for new ways of understanding the SAWP's engendering, embodied expressions. It also troubles the structural determinist view of a strictly policy-oriented analysis by making space for workers' agency, including how workers' efforts to disrupt their segregation creates rifts between their habitus and field. These acts of citizenship challenge the status quo and create new perspectives and actions that may be reflexively folded into new forms of habitus. This agency-centered perspective questions the notion that transnationality necessitates equal allegiance or affinities between two places. It also places the SAWP's precarious transnationality in the greater transnationality and habitus research conversations, which more often focus on the experiences of less precarious migrants.

Policy that fosters cyclical movements of people between spaces for decades creates a particular form of transnational community that makes place and home in multiple locations. Moreover, the Canadian seasonal agricultural regime and the broader systems of inequalities in which it is located engender a particular habitus amongst its participants, many of whom traverse its labour circuit for decades. The amassed body of research evidencing workers' experiences and precarity through the lens of habitus has identified and compiled instances and experiences that effect a particular habitus and expressions of transnationality for workers and their families. Future research is needed to understand the effects of the circular migrant habitus on workers' home lives and the lives of their families, both in the context of the Canadian SAWP and international programs that circulate temporary, international labour.

References

- Amnesty International (2016) *The Ugly Side of the Beautiful Game*, Amnesty International [online] <https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/mde22/3548/2016/en/> (accessed 10 February 2017).
- Bailey, A.J. (2001) 'Turning transnational: notes on the theorisation of international migration', *International Journal of Population Geography*, Vol. 7, No. 6, pp.413–428.

- Bartram, D. (2013) 'Happiness and 'economic migration': a comparison of Eastern European migrants and stayers', *Migration Studies*, Vol. 1, No. 2, pp.156–175.
- Basch, L., Glick Schiller, N. and Szanton Blanc, C. (1994) *Nations Unbound: Transnational Projects, Postcolonial Predicaments and Deterritorialized Nation-States*, Gordon & Breach, Langhorne, PA.
- Bauböck, R. (2003) 'Towards a political theory of migrant transnationalism', *International Migration Review*, Vol. 37, No. 3, pp.700–723.
- Bauder, H. (2005) 'Habitus, rules of the labour market, and employment strategies of immigrants in Vancouver, Canada', *Social and Cultural Geography*, Vol. 6, No. 1, pp.81–97.
- Bauder, H. (2006) 'Origin, employment status and attitudes towards work: immigrants in Vancouver, Canada', *Work, Employment, Society*, Vol.20, No. 4, pp.709–729.
- Bauder, H. (2008) 'Citizenship as capital: the distinction of migrant labour', *Alternatives*, Vol. 33, pp.315–333.
- Beaverstock, J.V. (2005) 'Transnational elites in the city: British highly-skilled inter-company transferees in New York city's financial district', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, Vol. 31, No. 2, pp.245–268.
- Becerril, O. (2007) 'Transnational work and the gendered politics of labour: a study of male and female Mexican migrant farm workers in Canada', in Goldring, L. and Krishnamurti, S. (Eds.): *Organizing the Transnational: Labour, Politics and Social Change*, pp.157–171, University of British Columbia Press, Vancouver.
- Binford, L. (2003) 'Migrant remittances and (under) development in Mexico', *Critique of Anthropology*, Vol. 23, No. 3, pp.305–336.
- Binford, L. (2009) 'From fields of power to fields of sweat: the dual process of constructing temporary migrant labour in Mexico and Canada', *Third World Quarterly*, Vol. 30, No. 3, pp.503–517.
- Black, D. (2014) *New Regulations to Temporary Foreign Worker Program Called a 'Smokescreen'* [online] https://www.thestar.com/news/canada/2014/01/03/new_regulations_to_temporary_foreign_worker_program_called_a_smokescreen.html (accessed 3 January 2014).
- Bourdieu, P. (1977) *Outline of a Theory of Practice*, Cambridge University Press, New York.
- Bourdieu, P. (1985) 'The genesis of the concepts of habitus and of field', *Sociocriticism*, Vol. 2, No. 11, pp.11–24.
- Bourdieu, P. (1990a) *The Logic of Practice*, Stanford University Press, Redwood City.
- Bourdieu, P. (1990b) *In Other Words: Essays Towards a Reflexive Sociology*, Policy Press, Cambridge.
- Bourdieu, P. (1999) 'Scattered remarks', *European Journal of Social Theory*, Vol. 2, No. 3, pp.334–340.
- Cui, D. (2015) 'Capital, distinction, and racialized habitus: immigrant youth in the educational field', *Journal of Youth Studies*, Vol. 18, No. 9, pp.1154–1169.
- Dance, M. (2014) 'Mark Dance: among the migrant workers in Canada', *National Post* [online] <http://nationalpost.com/opinion/mark-dance-among-the-migrant-workers-in-canada> (accessed 14 January 2018).
- Darvin, R. and Norton, B. (2014) 'Social class, identity, and migrant students', *Journal of Language, Identity & Education*, Vol. 13, No. 2, pp.111–117.
- Edmunds, K., Berman, H., Basok, T., Ford-Gilboe, M. and Forchuk, C. (2011) 'The health of women temporary agricultural workers in Canada: a critical review of the literature', *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research*, Vol. 43, No. 4, pp.68–91.
- Enlace Canada (2012) 'Migrant farm workers: the backbone of Ontario's agriculture', *Enlace Community Link Inc.* [online] <http://enlace-canada.ca/index.html> (accessed 15 January 2018).
- Erdal, M.B. and Oeppen, C. (2013) 'Migrant balancing acts: understanding the interactions between integration and transnationalism', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, Vol. 39, No. 6, pp.867–884.

- Erel, U. (2010) 'Migrating cultural capital: Bourdieu in migration studies', *Sociology*, Vol. 44, No. 4, pp.642–660.
- Faraday, F. (2012) *Made in Canada: How the Law Constructs Migrant Workers' Insecurity*, Metcalf Foundation, Toronto.
- Faraday, F. (2014) *Profiting from the Precarious: How Recruitment Practices Exploit Migrant Workers*, Metcalf Foundation.
- Fitzgerald, D. (2013) 'Immigrant impacts in Mexico: a tale of dissimilation', in Eckstein, S.E. and Najam, A. (Eds.): *How Immigrants Impact their Homelands*, pp.14–137, Duke University Press, Berkeley and Los Angeles, Durham, NC.
- Gabriel, C. and Macdonald, L. (2011) 'Citizenship at the margins: the Canadian seasonal agricultural worker program and civil society advocacy', *Politics & Policy*, Vol. 39, No. 1, pp.45–67.
- Gabriel, C. and Macdonald, L. (2014) "'Domestic transnationalism': legal advocacy for Mexican migrant workers' rights in Canada", *Citizenship Studies*, Vol. 18, Nos. 3–4, pp.243–258.
- Giammarinaro, M.G. (2016) *End of Visit Statement*, United Nations; Washington, DC [online] <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=21049&LangID=E#sthash.n9m8d49P.dpuf> (accessed 10 February 2017).
- Gleeson, S. (2009) 'From rights to claims: the role of civil society in making rights real for vulnerable workers', *Law & Society Review*, Vol. 43, No. 3, pp.669–700.
- Glick Schiller, N., Basch, L. and Szanton, C. (1995) 'From immigrant to transmigrant: theorizing transnational migration', *Anthropological Quarterly*, Vol. 68, No. 1, pp.48–63.
- Goldring, L. and Landolt, P. (2013) *Producing and Negotiating Non-Citizenship: Precarious Legal Status in Canada*, University of Toronto Press, Toronto.
- Goldring, L., Berinstein, C. and Bernhard, J. K. (2009) 'Institutionalizing precarious migratory status in Canada', *Citizenship Studies*, Vol. 13, No. 3, pp.239–265.
- Government of Canada (2016) *Annual Labour Market Impact Assessment Statistics 2008–2015 Primary Agricultural Stream* [online] <https://www.canada.ca/en/employment-social-development/services/foreign-workers/reports/2014/lmia-annual-statistics/agricultural.html?=&wbdisable=true> (accessed 10 February 2017).
- Hennebry, J. (2008) 'Bienvenidos a Canadá? Globalization and the migration industry surrounding temporary agricultural migration in Canada', *Canadian Studies in Population*, Vol. 35, No. 2, pp.339–356.
- Hennebry, J.L. (2006) *Globalization and the Mexican-Canadian Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program: Power, Racialization & Transnationalism in Temporary Migration*. Department of Sociology, Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Department of Sociology, University of Western Ontario.
- Hennebry, J.L. (2014) 'Transnational precarity: Women's migration work and Mexican seasonal agricultural migration', *International Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 44, No. 3, pp.42–59.
- Hildebrandt, A. (2014) 'How a little Alberta union helps temporary foreign workers become Canadian', *CBC News* [online] <http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/how-a-little-alberta-union-helps-temporary-foreign-workers-become-canadian-1.2629710> (accessed 10 January 2017).
- Hilsdon, A.M. (2007) 'Transnationalism and agency in East Malaysia: Filipina migrants in the nightlife industries', *The Australian Journal of Anthropology*, Vol. 18, No. 2, pp.172–193.
- Horgan, M. and Liinamaa, S. (2017) 'The social quarantining of migrant labour: everyday effects of temporary foreign worker regulation in Canada', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, Vol. 43, No. 5, pp.713–730.
- Ibrahim, J. (2016) *Bourdieu and Social Movements: Ideological Struggles in the British Anti Capitalist Movement*, Springer.
- Inghilleri, M. (2005) 'Mediating zones of uncertainty: interpreter agency, the interpreting habitus and political asylum adjudication', *The Translator*, Vol. 11, No. 1, pp.69–85.

- Isin, E.F. (2002) *Being Political: Genealogies of Citizenship*, University of Minnesota Press, Minnesota.
- Iskander, N. (2010) *Creative State: Forty Years of Migration and Development Policy in Morocco and Mexico*, Cornell University Press, Ithaca, NY.
- Justicia for Migrant Workers (J4MW) (2018) [online] http://www.justicia4migrantworkers.org/justicia_new.htm (accessed 15 January 2018).
- Karim, K.H. (1998) *From Ethnic Media to Global Media: Transnational Communication Networks among Diasporic Communities*, Transnational Communities Programme, University of Oxford.
- Kearney, M. (1995) 'The local and the global: the anthropology of globalization and transnationalism', *Annual Review of Anthropology*, Vol. 24, No. 1, pp.547–565.
- Kelly, P. and Lusic, T. (2006) 'Migration and the transnational habitus: evidence from Canada and the Philippines', *Environment and Planning*, Vol. 38, No. 5, pp.831–847.
- Keung, N. (2017) 'He's worked legally in Canada for 37 years but the government considers him 'temporary'', *Toronto Star* [online] <https://www.thestar.com/news/canada/migrants/2017/10/05/hes-worked-legally-in-canada-for-37-years-but-the-government-considers-him-temporary.html> (accessed 12 December 2017).
- Lamont, M. (1992) *Money, Morals and Manners: The Culture of the French and American Upper Class*, Chicago University Press, Chicago, IL.
- Lenard, P.T. and Straehle, C. (2012) 'Introduction', in Lenard, P.T. and Straehle, C. (Eds.): *Legislated Inequality: Temporary Labour Migration in Canada*, pp.3–25, McGill Queen's University Press, Montreal.
- Ley, D. (2004) 'Transnational spaces and everyday lives', *Transactions of the British Institute of Geographers*, Vol. 29, No. 2, pp.151–164.
- McLaughlin, J. and Hennebry, J. (2013) 'Pathways to precarity: structural vulnerabilities and lived consequences for migrant farmworkers in Canada', in Goldring, L. and Landolt, P. (Eds.): *Producing and Negotiating Non-Citizenship: Precarious Legal Status in Canada*, pp.175–192, University of Toronto Press, Toronto.
- McLaughlin, J.E. (2009) *Trouble in our Fields: Health and Human Rights among Mexican and Caribbean Migrant Farm Workers in Canada*, Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Department of Anthropology, University of Toronto.
- Migrant Workers Alliance for Change (2018) *About Us* [online] <https://migrantworkersalliance.org/about-us/> (accessed January 15, 2018).
- Migrante Canada (2018) *Campaigns* [online] <http://www.migrante.ca/> (accessed 15 January 2018).
- Miyares, I.M., Wright, R., Mountz, A., Bailey, A.J. and Jonak, J. (2003) 'The interrupted circle: truncated transnationalism and the Salvadoran experience', *Journal of Latin American Geography*, Vol. 2, No. 1, pp.74–86.
- Mojtehdzadeh, S., Keung, N., and Rankin, J. (2017) 'Leamington is at the frontline of the boom in migrant workers. Here's how it's changed', *Toronto Star* [online] <https://www.thestar.com/news/canada/migrants/2017/10/09/leamington-is-at-the-frontlines-of-the-boom-in-migrant-workers-heres-how-its-changed.html> (accessed 12 January 2018).
- Moncrieffe, J. (2006) 'The power of stigma: Encounters with 'street children' and 'restavecs' in Haiti', *IDS Bulletin*, Vol. 37, No. 6, pp.31–46.
- Morawska, E. (2014) 'Immigrant transnationalism and assimilation: a variety of combinations and the analytic strategy it suggests', in Joppke, C. and Morawska, E. (Eds.): *Toward Assimilation and Citizenship: Immigrants in Liberal Nation-States*, pp.133–176, Palgrave Macmillan, UK.
- Mountz, A. (2011) 'Specters at the port of entry: understanding state mobilities through an ontology of exclusion', *Mobilities*, Vol. 6, No. 3, pp.317–334.
- Muniandy, P. and Bonatti, V. (2014) 'Are migrants agents or instruments of development? The case of 'temporary' migration in Malaysia', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, Vol. 40, No. 11, pp.1836–1853.

- Municipality of Leamington (2017) *Migrant Workers Community Program* [online] <http://www.leamington.ca/en/discover/migrantworkerscommunityprogram.asp> (accessed 18 January 2018).
- Nedelcu, M (2012) 'Migrants' new transnational habitus: rethinking migration through a cosmopolitan lens in the digital age', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, Vol. 38, No. 9, pp.1339–1356.
- Nyers, P. (2010) 'No one is illegal between city and nation', *Studies in Social Justice*, Vol. 4, No. 2, pp.127–143.
- Parreñas, R.S. (2010) 'Homeward bound: the circular migration of entertainers between Japan and the Philippines', *Global Networks*, Vol. 10, No. 3, pp.301–323.
- Pérez-Armendáriz, C. (2014) 'Cross-border discussions and political behavior in migrant sending countries', *Studies in Comparative International Development*, Vol. 49, No. 1, pp.67–88.
- Portes, A. and Fernández-Kelly, P. (Eds.) (2015) *The State and the Grassroots: Immigrant Transnational Organizations in Four Continents*, Berghahn Books, New York.
- Portes, A., Guarnizo, L.E. and Landolt, P. (2017) 'Commentary on the study of transnationalism: pitfalls and promise of an emergent research field', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, Vol. 40, No. 9, pp.1486–1491.
- Preibisch, K. (2005) 'Gender transformative odysseys: tracing the experiences of transnational migrant women in rural Canada', *Canadian Woman Studies*, Vol. 24, No. 4, pp.91–97.
- Preibisch, K. and Grez, E.E. (2013) 'Between hearts and pockets: locating the outcomes of transnational homemaking practices among Mexican women in Canada's temporary migration programmes', *Citizenship Studies*, Vol. 17, Nos. 6–7, pp.785–802.
- Preibisch, K. and Hennebry, J. (2011) 'Temporary migration, chronic effects: the health of international migrant workers in Canada', *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, Vol. 183, No. 9, pp.1033–1038.
- Preibisch, K. and Santamaria, L.M.H. (2006) 'Engendering labour migration: the case of foreign workers in Canadian agriculture', in Dobrowolsky, A. and Tastsoglou, E. (Eds.): *Women, Migration and Citizenship: Making Local, National and Transnational Connections*, Ashgate Publishing, Wiltshire, England.
- Preibisch, K.L. (2004) 'Migrant agricultural workers and processes of social inclusion in rural Canada: *Encuentros and desencuentros*', *Canadian Journal of Latin American and Caribbean Studies*, Vol. 29, Nos. 57–58, pp.203–239.
- Preibisch, K.L. and Grez, E.E. (2010) 'The other side of *el otro lado*: Mexican migrant women and labor flexibility in Canadian agriculture', *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, Vol. 35, No. 2, pp.289–316.
- Raghuram, P. (2008) 'Governing the mobility of skills', in Gabrielle, Christina and Pellerin, Helene (Eds.): *Governing International Labour Migration: Current Issues, Challenges and Dilemmas*, Routledge/RIPE Studies in Global Political Economy, Routledge, UK.
- Raghuram, P. (2014) 'Brain circulation of precarious labour? Conceptualizing temporariness in the United Kingdom's National Health Service', in Vosko, L., Preston, V. and Latham, R. (Eds.): *Liberating Temporariness? Migration, Work and Citizenship in an Age of Insecurity*, McGill-Queen's University Press, Montreal and Kingston.
- Rajkumar, D., Berkowitz, L., Vosko, L., Preston, V. and Latham, R. (2012) 'At the temporary-permanent divide: how Canada produces temporariness and makes citizens through its security, work, and settlement policies', *Citizenship Studies*, Vol. 16, Nos. 3–4, pp.483–510.
- Rankin, J. (2017) 'Unscrupulous recruiters keep migrant workers in 'debt bondage'', *Toronto Star* [online] <https://www.thestar.com/news/canada/migrants/2017/10/08/unscrupulous-recruiters-keep-migrant-workers-in-debt-bondage.html> (accessed 14 January 2018).
- Reay, D. (2004) 'It's all becoming a habitus': Beyond the habitual use of habitus in educational research', *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, Vol. 25, No. 4, pp.431–444.

- Riaño, Y. and Baghdadi, N. (2007) 'Understanding the labour market participation of skilled immigrant women in Switzerland: the interplay of class, ethnicity, and gender', *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, Vol. 8, No. 2, pp.163–183.
- Robertson, G. and Curry, B. (2017) 'Royal bank apologizes to employees over outsourcing move', *Globe and Mail* [online] <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/report-on-business/economy/jobs/royal-bank-apologizes-to-employees-over-outsourcing-move/article11061489/> (accessed 15 December 2017).
- Rotz, S. (2017) "'They took our beads, it was a fair trade, get over it': Settler colonial logics, racial hierarchies and material dominance in Canadian agriculture', *Geoforum*, Vol. 82, pp.158–169.
- Ryan, L., Sales, R., Tilki, M. and Siara, B. (2009) 'Family strategies and transnational migration: Recent Polish migrants in London', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, Vol. 35, No. 1, pp.61–77.
- Sassen, S. (2002) 'Global cities and survival circuits', in Ehrenreich, B. and Hochschild, A.R. (Eds.): *Global Woman: Nannies, Maids and Sex Workers in the New Economy*, Henry Holt and Company, New York.
- Silverman, S.J. and Hari, A. (2016) 'Troubling the fields: Choice, consent, and coercion of Canada's seasonal agricultural workers', *International Migration*, Vol. 54, No. 5, pp.91–104.
- Smith, A.A. (2005) 'Legal consciousness and resistance in Caribbean seasonal agricultural workers', *Canadian Journal of Law and Society*, Vol. 20, No. 2, pp.95–122.
- Smith, A.A. (2015) 'Troubling 'Project Canada': the Caribbean and the making of 'unfree migrant labor'', *Canadian Journal of Latin American and Caribbean Studies*, Vol. 40, No. 2, pp.274–293.
- Smith, M.P. and Guarnizo, L.E. (Eds.) (1998) *Transnationalism from Below*, Vol. 6, Transaction Publishers, New Brunswick.
- Stasiulis, D. (2008) 'Revisiting the permanent-temporary labour migration dichotomy', in Gabriel, C. and Pellerin, H. (Eds.): *Governing International Labour Migration: Current Issues, Challenges, and Dilemmas*, pp.95–113, Routledge, Oxon.
- Tollefsen, A. and Lindgren, U. (2006) 'Transnational citizens or circulating semi-proletarians? A study of migration circulation between Sweden and Asia, Latin America and Africa between 1968 and 2002', *Population, Space and Place*, Vol. 12, No. 6, pp.517–527.
- Trotz, D.A. and Mullings, B. (2013) 'Transnational migration, the state, and development: reflecting on the 'diaspora option'', *Small Axe: A Caribbean Journal of Criticism*, Vol. 17, No. 2, pp.154–171.
- UFCW (2012) 'Agriculture workers' alliance', *E-News*, Vol. 5, No. 19, n.p.
- UFCW (2018) 'UFCW Canada celebrates with migrant workers at El Sembrador gathering', *UFCW* [online] http://www.ufcw.ca/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=2940:ufcw-canada-celebrates-with-migrant-workers-at-el-sembrador-gathering&Itemid=6&lang=en (accessed 15 January 2018).
- Valiani, S. (2013) 'The shifting landscape of contemporary Canadian immigration policy: the rise of temporary migration and employer-driven immigration', in Goldring, L. and Landolt, P. (Eds.): *Producing and Negotiating Non-Citizenship: Precarious Legal Status in Canada*, pp.55–70, University of Toronto Press, Toronto.
- Vertovec, S. (2001) 'Transnationalism and identity', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, Vol. 27, No. 4, pp.573–582.
- Vosko, L.F. (2018) 'Legal but deportable: Institutionalized deportability and the limits of collective bargaining among participants in Canada's Seasonal Agricultural Workers Program', *ILR Review*, Vol. 71, No. 4, pp.882–907.
- Waters, J.L. (2007) 'Roundabout routes and sanctuary schools: the role of situated educational practices and habitus in the creation of transnational professionals', *Global Networks*, Vol. 7, No. 4, pp.477–497.
- Widick, R. (2003) 'Flesh and the free market: (on taking bourdieu to the options exchange)', *Theory and Society*, Vol. 32, Nos. 5–6, pp.679–723.

Notes

- 1 Thanks to an anonymous reviewer for this articulation of the relationship between agency and precarity.
- 2 These programs have various internal requirements to qualify for permanent residency. For example, persons in the Caring for Children Program must have 24 months of full-time work experience within a four-year timeframe. The Low-Skilled Pilot Program does not have a direct pathway to permanency, but it does allow for participants to apply for permanency-gearred programs including the Provincial Nominee Program.
- 3 Thanks to an anonymous reviewer for this articulation.
- 4 Certainly, it would be misguided to assume all labourers sought or desired permanency in Canada; indeed, permanent migration and higher levels of income are not necessarily correlated with happiness (Bartram, 2013). However, freedom of mobility, choice, and access to contributory benefits, among other factors, can be more fairly assumed.